

WHEN DOES ONE NEED TO OWN THEIR LULAV?

WHERE	TEMPLE		OUTSIDE TEMPLE SHUL	
	DAY 1	OTHER DAYS	DAY 1	OTHER DAYS
TYPE	TORAH	TORAH	TORAH	725
RAMBAN	✓	X (B)	✓	X
TOSFOS	✓	✓	✓	X (C)

(A)

A) 1ST STATEMENT MISHNA — IN SHUL, DURING TEMPLE
(ONLY DURING TEMPLE TIMES DID LULAV OVERRIDE SHABBOS)

2ND STATEMENT MISHNA — IF DURING TEMPLE TIMES
(AS DETERMINED IN A) THIS CANNOT BE TALKING ABOUT IN
SHUL ... FOR NO 725 INSTITUTED YET!

ANSWER B) MUST BE TALKING ABOUT IN TEMPLE
(BUT ONLY MAKES SENSE ACCORDING
TO RAMBAN WHO HOLDS NO OWNERSHIP
NEEDED ON REMAINING DAYS IN TEMPLE)

ANSWER C) ACCORDING TO TOSFOS 2ND STATEMENT
OF MISHNA MUST BE TALKING ABOUT
OUTSIDE TEMPLE NOWADAYS WHEN 725
INSTITUTED AFTER TEMPLE DESTROYED.